## Appendix E

## Background Data Placemat




District Leadership Feedback

| Thought Question | Responses from Board Members, District Administrators, and Principal |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | For the larger part, the schools that are larger cost less to run. <br> The cost per student for CU is higher than our district peers and our class sizes are lower. <br> - Cost per student higher in ConVal than peers. <br> - Lowest class sizes - which research does not support - limit resources. <br> - Facilities costs for small schools are high for low students. |
| What are the data telling you? | That our long-term salaries are not likely conducive to retaining staff. <br> That our district is reasonably comparable to similar districts in the state. <br> Smaller class sizes cost more and do not yield better "pass" rates <br> Smaller population, higher cost per pupil. <br> Salary, distance for experience educators (in salary). <br> Cost per student with other districts higher.. <br> ConVal has higher per student cost, but lower teacher pay. <br> Food service/athletics are different at smaller schools. <br> Per students costs are higher in smaller schools. |



CES, INC

| Thought Question | Responses from Board Members, District Administrators, and Principal |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | - No demographic info. <br> - Demographics. <br> - What about transportation? <br> - Costs. <br> - Results. <br> - Belief of class size differences. |
| In discussing the data at your table, what concerns were raised that you had not considered? | - Class sizes comparisons to our peer districts with personnel costs given class size recommendations. <br> - That PES costs much more than AES. <br> - That specialists are not included in costs. <br> - We pay more money per student and our scores are average. <br> - What is Windham doing to be successful? <br> - Turnover rates in future years, not the beginning. <br> - SMS higher costs for personal, but likely due to special ed programs. <br> - Low class sizes do not hold Fall MT either <br> - That Peterborough ES and SMS have such significantly higher costs for Personnel and Facilities compared to other schools in the district. <br> - Windham has the largest student number. <br> - Number of buildings. <br> - The comparison to alike schools. <br> - Highest achievement. <br> - We are spending the most but performing lower on assessment data and have low average class sizes. <br> - Food equity. |
| How do the data align with your expectations? | We don't expect what we are seeing. <br> - Enrollment and class size are low, costs are highest, and academic results are middle of the pack. <br> - The district seems comparable to other similar districts. <br> - Fairly well aligned with what I expected. <br> - No surprise. <br> - Was known and now validated. <br> - Not sure the facility costs are completely adequate - they reflect special costs like parking lot at high school or boilers. <br> - Fairly well - just surprised at how many areas demonstrated that cost and class sizes. <br> - This was what l expected. <br> - Was surprised the ConVal class sizes were one of the smallest. <br> - HES cost per student out of line with other small schools. <br> - This is no surprise. <br> - We have been looking at these comparisons for years! <br> - Generally what I expected. <br> - Surprised that class size does not equate to achievement. <br> - Yes, it is consistent with what I expected. |


| Thought Question | Responses from Board Members, District Administrators, and Prin |
| :---: | :---: |
| What surprises you about the data? | Teacher salaries - especially as your tenure evolves with the district. <br> Did not know the number of schools in peer district, most fewer schools. <br> We also have more schools than our peer districts. <br> That tech, facilities, and transportation have passed the equity checks (we are happy). <br> That it costs 20\% more to operate DCS. <br> Disparity in cost per student, facilities costs, and class size. <br> That year 15 salaries are so much lower in ConVal. <br> To the public, salaries might be a surprise. <br> We are spending the most, but not on experienced teachers (year 15). <br> What happens to salary comparison between year 5 and year 15 <br> Windham test scores. <br> We may be over emphasizing lower class sizes when prioritizing budgeting/spending. <br> I am not surprised. <br> We have been analyzing this data for years! <br> Cost of teachers at ConVal and peer schools. <br> Schools have different costs. <br> Success of Windham at cost. <br> Costs at GBS are greater than high school. <br> We have low teacher salary but are the highest cost per student. <br> Per pupil costs (schools within district) compared to peer districts. <br> HES has lower cost per student. <br> Number of schools comparatively. <br> Teacher salary (veteran) <br> Class sizes in other districts. |
| What factors may explain the data results? | Our operations plan has not changed even though enrollment and other factors have determined a need. <br> - Lots of money goes into small schools teaching and facilities that could be used to support students if we consolidate. <br> - DCS cost per pupil is due to Veteran staff. <br> - Less children equal higher cost per student. <br> - Socioeconomics. <br> - We need to make some significant changes. <br> - Low student to teacher ratio. <br> - School size/enrollment differences in costs. <br> - Multiple buildings. <br> - ConVal has too many elementary schools. <br> - Socioeconomics. <br> - Staff retention. <br> - Shared resources across buildings. <br> - One assessment data point. |

- Review consolidation based on the data.
- Ask our peer district schools what they are doing with their resources.
- There is a need to make changes.
- Consider consolidation of elementary schools, so there is richer programing, instructions, and equity.
- Increase class sizes to reduce costs and provide resources
- Looking at advantages of reducing cost.
- Equity in cocurricular/athletics.
- Equity in planning time.
- Clearly showing impact of population growth in next 10 years.
- Correlation between local schools and home values.

Based on the data, what actions does ConVal need to take?

- Reduction everywhere in district except for teachers (admin, facilities, food services)
- Temple needs additional supports, ways to grow class sizes
- Increase class sizes to decrease costs.
- Do something about small schools.
- Consolidation!
- Look to consolidate some of the schools and reevaluate spending priorities outside of consolidation.
- Consolidate.
- The high number of buildings creates inequities.
- Not enough resources to be fully equitable.
- Chosen to prioritize tech/facilities/transport over food and athletics.
- Reconfiguration that includes consolidation.
- Increase class sizes (consolidate).
- Increase teacher salaries.
- Something needs to happen, we are spread too thin.

Community Input Placemat

| (同) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Once a ConVal elementary school has less than ___ students, we should consider closing it. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Antrim | Bennington | Dublin | Francestown | Greenfield | Hancock | Peterborough | Sharon | Temple |
| 25 | 69\% | 76\% | 55\% | 52\% | 79\% | 71\% | 88\% | 91\% | 44\% |
| 50 | 48\% | 52\% | 33\% | 33\% | 59\% | 48\% | 75\% | 61\% | 20\% |
| 75 | 17\% | 19\% | 9\% | 14\% | 23\% | 17\% | 40\% | 33\% | 10\% |
| 100 | $4 \%$ | 10\% | 5\% | 6\% | 10\% | 8\% | 20\% | 19\% | 6\% |
| Never close | 31\% | 24\% | 45\% | 48\% | 21\% | 29\% | 12\% | 9\% | 56\% |

When asked to rate 4 options in Token Polling, 5 towns selected this as their top option:
"Combine only some of the elementary schools in order to provide students with better academic/enrichment options and save some money."

When asked to choose which of 5 options to fund with $\$ 1 \mathrm{M}, 5$ towns selected this option most frequently:
"Retain our small-town elementary school."




District Leadership Feedback

| Thought <br> Question | Responses from Board Members, District Administrators, and Principal |
| ---: | :--- |
|  | Collaboration. <br> People in many smalls don't want changes. <br> Kids have had good experience overall (4\% "F") <br> The community is invested in keeping their schools but not paying for them. <br> What are the <br> data telling |
| you? |  |$\quad$| Sothing surprising. |
| :--- |
| So many varied opinions... varying communities, varied ages. |


| Thought <br> Question | Responses from Board Members, District Administrators, and Principal |
| :--- | :--- |
|  | Most towns identifies less than 50 students as the most frequent response of <br> when to consider closing. Dublin, Francestown, and Temple had the highest \%'s. <br> Data shows that we really need to pay attention, $44 \%$ worry about tax bill |
| $56 \%$ believe current configuration is not the best use of financial resources. |  |
| That people do not want to close schools. |  |


| Thought Question | Responses from Board Members, District Administrators, and Princip |
| :---: | :---: |
| What most concerns you about the student data? | $67 \%$ want more STEM (MS) and $59 \%$ HS. <br> Not enough students included in the data (not enough participants). <br> $66 \%$ (community input) state if rigor is maintained, I prefer a reduced cost to taxpayers. <br> - They would like more options without considerations of costs. <br> - That the students almost $50 \%$ at the middle and almost $60 \%$ at HS feel that something is missing <br> - Both middle and high schools reported wanting more STEM and arts opportunities. <br> - No huge concerns - but more STEM (what would that look like to students?) <br> - Desire for more electives. <br> - Looking at new data - asking for larger schools for more friends, maybe less bullying. <br> - 50/50 for wanting smaller classes predominantly female replies. <br> - Students should get same services belief (92\%). <br> - Retain small elementary school. <br> - $30 \%$ different in rigor staff input. <br> - That students do not feel that there were enough art/music. <br> - That so few students think there are enough arts electives; that there are so many looking for additional STEM options. |
| What most concerns you about the community data? | Limited desire for any type of change/consolidation. <br> $31 \%$ staff with rigor equity and $30 \%$ staff with money equity. <br> For the question that asks if MS students were better prepared (3rd question on student response) - what school did each student come from - who answered them based on home elementary? <br> - See what stands out and that 1 million can provide enough money to keep equity and not cut MS/HS programming. <br> - $44 \%$ worry about paying tax bill! <br> - That will continue to go up. <br> - 5 towns selected to retain our small school. <br> - Community not understanding the measures/supports - transportation, special education, instruction. <br> - Not making the connection of keeping school open and paying taxes. <br> - $44 \%$ worry about how they will pay their tax bill. <br> - $56 \%$ believe the low enrollment elementary schools believe it is not the best use of financial resources. <br> - $92 \%$ of the community believe students should get the same services across all schools. <br> - Comments seem to indicate that great schools are most drawn for young families to move into town. <br> - A great factor is the lack of affordable housing. <br> - $72 \%$ said every school have equal student spending. |


| Thought <br> Question | Responses from Board Members, District Administrators, and Principal |
| ---: | :--- |
|  | While were need to reduce costs (by increasing class sizes), community and staff <br> agree that smaller class sizes learn better. |
| That 5 towns chose diametrically opposing options with token polling vs \$1 million |  |
| activity. |  |
| That only $66 \%$ state agree with keeping rigor and reducing taxes (seems that |  |
| would be a logical yes). |  |

about the
data? There were more students.

- Same residents do not make connection between costly schools and tax bill.
- I am surprised by this data.

30\% believe that resources are allocated equitably

- $90 \%$ - offer teachers competitive salaries.

96\% of students gave C or better.

- That many teachers feel they do not have enough time to collaborate with peers as we do have opportunities to do so.
- $90 \%$ parents said offer competitive salaries.
- That 44\% worry about paying their tax bill each year.
- $90 \%$ agree with competitive salaries.

74\% support early start time!!!

- Taxpayers without students in building or are not aware of the conversations around consolidation.
- Culture and context - personal experience.
- Change is challenging.
- Small towns.
- People are not basing their decisions on data.
- I wish I could see the student data broken out by which elementary they went to.
- Not knowing all ramifications of closing schools.
- Not fully understanding the social-emotional challenges of small schools.

What factors
may explain
the data results?

- Emotional responses.
- They are purely emotional responses and they have no understanding how a school is run.
- The way questions were asked.
- Who responded to the opportunities to provide feedback?
- Community thought this was done just to close their schools.
- Community knowledge of school resources.
- $92 \%$ same service across school and 90\% increase salaries, but also want small school and better experiences.
- Strong attachments to local schools - sense of community and pride.
- Some community members influence by whether their town school would most likely be one to close.
- "Never close"\% seems influence by that.

Beliefs and Research Placemat

## Beliefs and Research

Belief: More students will come.

| School | Student Enrollment |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $2013-14$ | $2022-23$ | \# Change | $\%$ Change |
| AES | 152 | 128 | -24 | $-15.8 \%$ |
| BES | 54 | 65 | 11 | $20.4 \%$ |
| DES | 61 | 57 | -4 | $-6.6 \%$ |
| FES | 58 | 42 | -16 | $-27.6 \%$ |
| GES | 97 | 93 | -4 | $-4.1 \%$ |
| HES | 77 | 69 | -8 | $-10.4 \%$ |
| PES | 246 | 238 | -8 | $-3.3 \%$ |
| TES | 65 | 31 | -34 | $-52.3 \%$ |
| GBS | 261 | 224 | -37 | $-14.2 \%$ |
| SMS | 441 | 339 | -102 | $-23.1 \%$ |
| Conval HS | 845 | 683 | -162 | $-19.2 \%$ |
| District | 2,357 | 1,969 | -388 | $-16.5 \%$ |

Belief: Property values benefit from having an ES in town.

- "Prices rise with school quality" - NYT 2017
- "Parents do pay more to live in areas with better schools." - Wulsin, 2009
- Prismatic checked with local realtors - no local effect noted.

Belief: Smaller is better.

- Of influences which impact student achievement, reducing class size ranked 186 out of 252 , with an effect size of 0.21 . Collective teacher efficacy, teacher quality, curriculum, and instructional strategies have a greater impact than reducing class size. (Hattie, 2018).
- Class size research typically refers to classes with 20 or fewer students as "small" in size. In elementary classes with 20 or fewer students, achievement, engagement, and long-term success were better overall, than classes with more than 20 students. - NCTE, 2023

Belief: ConVal students have the same opportunities and performance of those in peer districts.

| District | $2020-21$ |  | $2021-22$ |  | $2022-23$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | ELA | MATH | ELA | MATH | ELA | MATH |
| ConVal | $47 \%$ | $32 \%$ | $48 \%$ | $37 \%$ | $51 \%$ | $40 \%$ |
| Fall Mtn | $48 \%$ | $33 \%$ | $50 \%$ | $36 \%$ | $51 \%$ | $36 \%$ |
| Gilford | $53 \%$ | $53 \%$ | $57 \%$ | $50 \%$ | $54 \%$ | $49 \%$ |
| Kearsarge | $60 \%$ | $44 \%$ | $56 \%$ | $44 \%$ | $59 \%$ | $41 \%$ |
| Litchfield | $56 \%$ | $39 \%$ | $52 \%$ | $37 \%$ | $55 \%$ | $38 \%$ |
| Monadnock | $37 \%$ | $25 \%$ | $38 \%$ | $29 \%$ | $39 \%$ | $31 \%$ |
| Windham | $74 \%$ | $64 \%$ | $73 \%$ | $68 \%$ | $75 \%$ | $70 \%$ |
| State | $52 \%$ | $38 \%$ | $51 \%$ | $40 \%$ | $52 \%$ | $42 \%$ |

## Beliefs and Research

Belief: MS/HS students are not missing opportunities.

- Only Spanish/German offered in HS; no world language offered in MS
- Some seniors run out of electives after they meet 26 credits because of lack of classes and teachers.
- Students would like to have more music, visual and performing arts, literature, culinary, engineering, trades, and STEM courses in middle and high school.
- Some students are unable to participate in afterschool activities because they lack transportation.
- Some neighboring districts have clubs that ConVal middle and high schools do not have (Builders Club, Coding Club, Game Club, School News, Guitar Club, Honor Societies, etc.)


## Belief: Multi-age classrooms are bad.

- There is currently a lack of equity of curriculum currently in ConVal schools. Teachers shared that they pick and choose from available resources.
- In multi-grade classes, "older children have the opportunity to serve as mentors and to take leadership roles. Older children model more sophisticated approaches to problem solving, and younger children are able to accomplish tasks they could not do without the assistance of older children. This dynamic increases the older child's level of independence and competence." - ACEI

Multi-grade classrooms can be successful if the
following are in place:

- time for adequate teacher planning
* appropriate instructional resources for both grade levels
- careful consideration of which students are selected to be assigned to the multi-grade class
- classroom support to ensure the teacher has adequate time to teach curriculum for each grade level as appropriate, and offer support for students who struggle


## District Leadership Feedback

| Thought Question | Responses from Board Members, District Administrators, and Principal |
| :---: | :---: |
| Which beliefs do you find hard to believe? | - That some students have the same opportunities and performance. <br> - Also smaller is better. <br> - Smaller is not always better, one of my kids moved from a smaller elementary to a bigger one and the larger class sizes and increased opportunities helped them. <br> - MS/HS students are not missing opportunities. <br> - Smaller is better. <br> - No surprises. <br> - \% of ELA data/math data don't touch on "same opportunities", only performers <br> - Multi-age classrooms are bad. <br> - More students will come. <br> - MS/HS students are not missing opportunities. <br> - Multi-age is bad. <br> - That the people believe the students come. <br> - Because we provide a alate bus, it is hard to believe they can't participate due to transportation |
| PR SMATIC |  |


| Thought Question | Responses from Board Members, District Administrators, and Principal |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | - More students will come. <br> - Multi-age classrooms are bad. |
| Which beliefs do you find easy to believe? | - Property values could decrease. <br> - Prices rise with school quality and people look for good schools when purchasing a home. <br> - Population is not growing. <br> - That curriculum, quality of teachers and efficacy, and instructional strategies have a greater impact than class size. <br> - Class size data showing smaller is not better. <br> - Multi-age can work if certain things are in place. <br> - Access to school/not having a school matter for property values <br> - Smaller is better. <br> - Property values benefits from having an ES in town. <br> - More students will come. <br> - That people think home values will increase with a school in the district. <br> - That people believe smaller class sizes = better scores. <br> - Smaller is better. <br> - Multi-age classrooms are bad. <br> - Smaller is better. <br> - Home value will decrease without a school. <br> - All of them, I have heard them all. |
| What really stands out for you in the data? | That consideration should be given to who is assigned to a multi-age class. <br> Seniors are running out of electives, lack of world language options. <br> Why German? <br> - Enrollment decline. <br> - The general declines in student numbers. <br> - They will not come. Smaller is not better. <br> - The belief of multi-age. <br> - ConVal math scores were up $8 \%$ and ELA was up 4\% (both were more than all others). <br> - There is no distinction between multi-age and grade. <br> - Doesn't accurately reflect the reality of our small school reality of multi-grade classes. <br> - $16.5 \%$ decline in district. <br> - Lack of equity in curriculum. <br> - The student enrollment declines and the comments from the community regarding this. <br> - Projected enrollment decline. <br> - Belief students are not missing opportunities. <br> - Population drops over time (come on slowly, not dramatic). <br> - Student opportunities. <br> - Decrease in enrollment. |


| Thought Question | Responses from Board Members, District Administrators, and Principal |
| :---: | :---: |
| In discussing the data at your table, what concerns were raised that you had not considered? | How planning for multi-age classrooms occurs - they need more planning time. <br> - The cost of housing. <br> - Concern is that change may rest on voter decisions and turnout the beliefs of smaller/better real estate prices. <br> - They welcome other things over research bused plans. <br> - How much homeschooling, private and charter. <br> - Affordable housing. <br> - There is no place for the average person to live. <br> - The want of more electives. <br> - Instructional statistics/equity in curriculum . <br> - How did the realtor data reflect a town with no ES vs one with and ES. <br> - Seniors run out of electives. <br> - That the children are not being born. <br> - How to validate/support "no local effect noted" on property values. |
| Which of the beliefs do you think will be hardest to counter with research? Why? | Small class sizes - parents and students love their small schools and teachers. <br> - Smaller is better. I feel that class size has been a high priority consideration for so long that it's part of the cultural discourse. <br> - Smaller is better - research resistant. It is a feel-good perception - a nuturist philosophy. <br> - None. <br> - Smaller class sizes are best. <br> - Class size, people believe small classes are good and that bigger classes may affect student learning and experience negativity weekly) <br> - More students will come. Hope is hard to counter. <br> - MS not missing opportunities unless only speaking about foreign language. There are a ton of extra opportunities at both SMS and GBS. <br> - Belief that smaller is better. People will think they are right. <br> - Property value based off school in town. <br> - Smaller is better. <br> - When is too small, too small. <br> - Multi-age classrooms are bad. <br> - Range is the range. <br> - Small class size is 20. <br> - Smaller is better. <br> - That MS/HS aren't being short changed. |
| Based on the beliefs and research shown, what actions does | Educate the community regarding the data to help alter beliefs. <br> Educate populace about research. Lack of affordable housing makes it unlikely that more students will come. <br> ConVal needs to make a big effort to help communities. <br> There is a sweet spot where large classrooms (average 20) are better than the very small classes. <br> - What we are giving up for is the very small class sizes. |


| Thought Question | Responses from Board Members, District Administrators, and Principal |
| :---: | :---: |
| ConVal need to take? | - Prepare for less students. <br> - Strong focus on curriculum. <br> - They need to look at increasing class sizes and consolidation schools. <br> - Reduce class size. <br> - Increase collaboration. <br> - Recognizes there will not be an increase in enrollment. <br> - First - share info about how they will not come. <br> - Accept things that we can't tame and take action with what we can do. <br> - We need to come to terms with the data and make some changes. <br> - Public awareness of inadequacies (pros and cons) <br> - Something about elementary schools. |
| Based on the beliefs and research shown, what new questions do you have? | What would happen to "empty" school buildings? <br> Current GPA system discourages high school students interested in class rank from taking advantage of already limited electives and graded opportunities. <br> Expand the research. <br> Under 20 outcomes do not improve. <br> Need to increase teacher efficacy and lack of equity in curriculum <br> Consolidation along with other components such as training collaboration, etc. is needed. <br> - Need more cited research in this area. <br> - What can towns do to enhance the resources, values and experiences for families that they would miss if their school closed? <br> - Can we build mentorship programs for all teachers and staff? <br> - How would consolidation benefit our community? <br> - How do we capitalize on the information about teacher quality and instruction and impact upon achievement? <br> - On December 4th, will prismatic offer multiple choices/recommendations to move forward to the school board? <br> - Will the options be ranked based on professional rec's/data from prismatic. <br> - When is too small, too small? Reference of "20 or fewer" in NCTE, 2023 quote. <br> - None. | ,

